Services liberalisation in preferential trade agreements and under the GATS

Implications for regional integration agendas and development space in southern Africa

Niki Cattaneo
tralac Associate
Rhodes University
Aim and Overview

Aim:
To examine the growing literature and debates surrounding the services aspects of regional integration agreements

Overview:
- Importance of the services sector in development
- Trade in services and the GATS
- Services aspects of regional integration agreements in a developing country context
- Implications for integration agendas and trade negotiations in southern Africa
The importance of the services sector in development

- Regional integration in southern Africa long seen as a vehicle for development through industrialisation
- But has been increasing and renewed recognition of importance of a growing and efficient services sector in development
- Consequence of
  - importance of service sector as direct contributor to GDP and employment
  - growing services trade
  - importance in supporting manufacturing production and trade
The importance of the services sector in development

Debate:

- Services sector itself as the engine of growth and development?
  - Sheehan (2008): constraints on development through industrialisation; recent experiences of China (strategy shift) & India (growth largely based on services sector)
  - Dasgupta & Singh (2006): “premature deindustrialisation”, jobless manufacturing growth, faster growth in services; replacing vs complementing manufacturing
  - Bell and Madula (2001): manufacturing “still matters a good deal”

- Services sector as supporter and facilitator of manufacturing production and trade
  - ICT and producer services growth as a source of development (Nordas, 2001)
  - role in production networks and fragmented trade: potential benefits in a developing country regional integration context (Nordas et al., 2000; Haddad, 2007; Arndt, 2004)
Trade in services and the GATS

• Implications of services liberalisation by southern African countries (regional or multilateral) need careful analysis

• Benefits often simply assumed

• Consequences of hasty or poorly-sequenced liberalisation may be severe both for services sector and macroeconomy
Trade in services and the GATS

Services liberalisation recognised as more complicated than goods liberalisation:

- Proximity often required between producer and consumer (consumer, producer or capital must move); leads to the GATS modes of supply:
  - Mode 1: cross-border supply
  - Mode 2: consumption abroad
  - Mode 3: commercial presence
  - Mode 4: presence of natural persons

- Barriers largely NTBs often deeply embedded into national policy frameworks (eg regulations & laws)

- Thus greater complexities and sensitivities
Trade in services and the GATS

• GATS shortcomings (Steenkamp, 2003)
• Concerns in the developing country context
  – Neo-mercantilism
  – Strong pressure brought to bear based on commercial interests of developed countries
  – Closing of development policy space (Wade, 2003; Fryer et al., 2005)
• Some southern African cases:
  – Mauritius (Dabee, 2000): limited liberalisation consistent with development objectives and Mauritius’ strengths
  – Lesotho (Manduna, 2005): institutional capacity constraints, weakness of private sector, technical assistance needed, flexibility to pursue development goals
  – South Africa (Mene, 2008)
• Article V of GATS and services provisions in regional trade agreements (Stephenson, 2002)
Services aspects of regional integration agreements

• Are the benefits of services liberalisation greater, or likely to be better harnessed, in a regional context?
• Could the costs or risks be less?
• If liberalisation is desirable, then will regional services liberalisation inhibit or facilitate multilateral liberalisation?
• Do the answers to these questions differ for North-South and South-South regional agreements?
Services aspects of regional integration agreements

Economic analysis of preferences in the services context (Mattoo and Fink, 2002):

- Less chance of trade diversion
- Increased competition, economies of scale, potential knowledge spillovers
- Agglomeration versus spreading out of firms
- More efficient bargaining
- Regulatory cooperation
- Sequencing important
- Regionalism and learning-by-doing
Some regional experiences:

- **Latin American RIAs (Stephenson, 2002)**
  - Largely South-South
  - Depth compared to GATS (Hoekman, 2006)
    - Disciplines: national treatment, market access often general obligations in RIAs (are not in GATS)
    - Sectoral coverage: GATS positive list approach; many RIAs negative list (more transparent)
    - Tend to go further than GATS; will this be extended to multilateral setting?
Some regional experiences cont:

- **SADC and the EPAs**
  - North-South
  - Key objections and concerns (TWN, 2008)
    - Extent and speed of commitments sought
    - MFN clause (extend to EU preferences given even other developing countries; against spirit of Enabling Clause)
    - Standstill clause (stricter than WTO?)
    - Infant industry clause criticised
    - Time needed to build capacity (institutional, negotiating)
    - Interference with SSA regional integration agenda and divisions caused
    - Export taxes

- **Intra-EU services liberalisation** (time and speed!)
Implications for integration agendas in the region

- SADC’s options range from restricting services liberalisation offers to the multilateral setting, to a full range of negotiations – multilateral, intra-SADC, SADC-EPA etc.
- Caution is urged due to the implications of haste and/or poor sequencing
- Properly informed research and debate focused on development theory and experience elsewhere needed
- Analysis of studies such as Jansen (2006a,b)
- Do not neglect building capacity for an appropriate industrial policy (Wade, 2003; Chang, 2005)
Selected references


Selected references cont.


Selected references cont.