ACCESSION TO THE WORLD TRADE ORGANIZATION

BEST PRACTICES ON WTO POST-ACCESSION

Note by the Secretariat

This document has been prepared under the Secretariat’s own responsibility and is without prejudice to the positions of Members or to their rights and obligations under the WTO.
1 INTRODUCTION

1. WTO membership and Director-General Roberto Azevêdo attach great importance to post-accession implementation and support. Building on the conceptual framework developed in the Director-General's 2014 Annual Report on WTO Accessions, the Secretariat has continued to deepen its understanding on post-accession needs of future Article XII Members and its efforts to operationalise the post-accession framework, with the support of Members and acceding governments. In this regard, the first dialogue on post-accession at the Third China Round Table held in Dushanbe in May 2015 provided rich insights based on direct experiences, which helped the Secretariat to structure its post-accession support to new Article XII Members. Moreover, the recently concluded accessions of Afghanistan and Liberia with their post-accession needs already built into the accession packages provide an operational mechanism for post-accession implementation and coordination in response to the specific needs of the least-developed countries (LDCs).

2. The framework for WTO post-accession implementation and support is structured into four pillars, as follows:
   - Best Practices on WTO Post-Accession;
   - Country-Specific WTO Post-Accession Implementation Strategy for LDCs;
   - Specialised Training on WTO Post-Accession for LDCs; and,
   - Internal Secretariat Note on Post-Accession Implementation and Monitoring.

The four pillars are complementary to each other.

3. The first pillar, 'Best Practices on WTO Post-Accession', whose details are contained in this Note, is aimed at assisting Acceding Governments and new Members in the transition from the accession negotiations to the membership. WTO accession is a tool for domestic reforms and integration into the rules-based global economy. Yet, WTO membership does not automatically lead to trade-related development, as the realisation of its benefits is inter-dependent with sustained domestic reforms and implementation of WTO obligations, including accession-specific commitments. The completion of an accession process does not mark an end but signals the beginning of sustained economic reforms to maximize the benefits of WTO membership and ensure global economic integration. Best practices on post-accession are drawn from the lessons learned and direct experiences of thirty-six accessions concluded to date since the establishment of the WTO since 1995.

4. The second pillar is the 'Country-Specific WTO Post-Accession Implementation Strategy' for LDCs. In the recently concluded accessions of Liberia and Afghanistan to the WTO, Post-Accession Implementation Strategies were prepared as integral parts of their respective Accession Packages. The WTO Secretariat developed the Strategies in consultation with the Acceding Governments, following the final Working Party meetings for Liberia in October 2015 and for Afghanistan in November 2015. The main focus of the Strategies is on the implementation of accession commitments, including notification obligations, and the identification and sequencing of specific post-accession needs for trade-related technical assistance and capacity building and infrastructural support for implementation. The Strategy contains three parts:
   - Annex I: Actions and work to be undertaken to implement accession-specific commitments contained in the Accession Protocol within defined timeframes;
   - Annex II: Notification requirements, contained in the WTO Agreements and the Accession Protocol, with technical assistance and capacity building needs; and,
   - Annex III: Complementary actions and support, including soft and hard infrastructural support, to realize the benefits of WTO membership and integration into the global economy.
Liberia and Afghanistan presented their respective Post-Accession Implementation Strategies to bilateral and multilateral development partners, at the Post-Accession Round Tables which took place immediately following the approval of the accession packages by WTO Members at the Tenth Ministerial Conference in December 2015 in Nairobi, Kenya.

5. The third pillar is 'Specialised Training on Post-accession' for LDCs. The purpose of such training, which is usually held before the membership date, is to: (i) provide post-accession support for an LDC, including on the preparation of notifications and the internal coordination to implement accession commitments from Day 1 of WTO membership; (ii) develop a medium term action plan to operationalise the Post-Accession Implementation Strategy; and, (iii) facilitate the exchange of post-accession experiences and best practices among Acceding Governments and recently acceded Members. The first of such specialised post-accession training activities is delivered by the WTO Secretariat for Afghanistan and Liberia in June 2016, before their WTO membership dates. The provision of WTO Secretariat post-accession support for Pillar 2 and Pillar 3 is normally restricted to LDCs only and is in response to specific requests from acceding LDCs.

6. The fourth pillar is the 'Secretariat's Note on Post-Accession Implementation and Monitoring'. The Note, developed under the guidance of Deputy Director-General David P. Shark is internal to the WTO Secretariat. It aims at improving internal Secretariat coordination for monitoring and support for new Article XII Members on the implementation of their specific accession commitments/obligations. A template of the Note was first developed in early 2014, and country-specific Notes have been issued for Yemen, Seychelles and Kazakhstan, generally on the membership date.

2 WTO POST-ACCESSION: BACKGROUND, CONCEPT AND FRAMEWORK

7. WTO membership can be demanding and complex. In the past 20 years, Article XII Members, in particular LDCs, have increased their requests for Secretariat's post-accession support. Such requests have covered a full spectrum of WTO-related issues. This Note has been prepared in response to demands by Acceding Governments and Article XII Members to compile, structure and share emerging best practices on post-accession, based on the experiences and lessons from 36 completed accessions to date.2

8. In May 2015, the Third China Round Table was held in Dushanbe, Tajikistan, with the thematic focus on "Post-Accession: Maximizing the Benefits of WTO Membership and Global Economic Integration". As part of the preparations for the Round Table, the Secretariat conducted a preliminary survey on post-accession practices, based on available information such as reports of the Trade Policy Reviews, presentations on post-accession experiences and interviews with Article XII Members. Based on the Secretariat's presentation on this preliminary survey, the Dushanbe China Round Table provided a platform, for the first time, for Article XII Members and Acceding Governments to discuss and share their post-accession experience, practices and lessons learned, in order to identify best practices on post-accession.3 The best practices identified by the Round Table are intended to assist Article XII Members in a smooth transition from the accession mode to the membership mode. That is, from Day 1 of membership, new Article XII Members should be equipped to implement their accession commitments, participate in the work of the WTO and realize the benefits of their membership. The "outcome document" from the Dushanbe Round Table, entitled "The Dushanbe Statement" (in document WT/ACC/24), reflects the result of the discussions, valuable lessons, and practical recommendations on post-accession practices that would promote active participation and operational WTO membership.

9. Following the Dushanbe Round Table, the Secretariat refined and updated its preliminary survey on post-accession in response to the request by Round Table participants to extend and deepen the survey (paragraph 29 of the Dushanbe Statement). A detailed questionnaire on post-accession was sent to Article XII Members with a view to complementing the results of the

---

1 WTO National Workshops on Post-Accession are held for Liberia on 27-29 June 2016 and for Afghanistan on 11-15 July 2016, before their respective WTO membership dates of 14 July and 29 July.
2 The 36 completed accessions include Liberia and Afghanistan which become WTO Members in July 2016.
3 The program for the Dushanbe Round Table and presentations made at the Round Table can be found at the WTO website: https://www.wto.org/english/thewto_e/acc_e/beijingroundtable2015_e.htm.
preliminary survey in 2015 (Annex 1). This Note reflects updated Best Practices on WTO Post-Accession, based on the replies received from 14 Article XII Members.

10. The concept, framework and support for post-accession were first defined in the 2014 Director-General’s Annual Report on WTO Accessions (document WT/ACC/23). Post-accession is defined in two stages: (i) immediate pre-accession phase, i.e. from the approval of the Accession Protocol to Day 1 of the membership; and, (ii) post-accession transition phase from Day 1 of the membership and the first Trade Policy Review (TPR). Since the implementation of the Accession Protocol to Day 1 of the membership; and, (ii) post-accession transition phase parallel to the domestic ratification process of the Protocol (during the “period for acceptance”). Based on the 36 completed accessions (including Liberia and Afghanistan), the period for acceptance, as specified in the Protocol typically in the range of three to six months, is 133 days on average (Table 1). It is during this short but critical period when a post-accession structure should ideally be put in place in order to switch the gear from the accession mode to the membership mode, together with a "mental" shift in behaviour and engagement with other Members in the WTO. In particular, it is essential to prepare for WTO membership, based on best practices on post-accession in seven areas, as outlined in Section 3.

Table 1: Membership Date, Acceptance Period and First Trade Policy Review of Article XII Members

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Article XII Member</th>
<th>Date of Membership</th>
<th>Acceptance Period (in calendar days)</th>
<th>Date of First Trade Policy Review (TPR)</th>
<th>Period between Membership and First TPR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Ecuador</td>
<td>21/01/1996</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>15+17/06/2005</td>
<td>9 years 5 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Bulgaria</td>
<td>01/12/1996</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>15+17/10/2003</td>
<td>6 years 10 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Mongolia</td>
<td>29/01/1997</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>15+17/03/2005</td>
<td>8 years 2 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Panama</td>
<td>06/09/1997</td>
<td>309</td>
<td>17+19/09/2007</td>
<td>10 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Kyrgyz Republic</td>
<td>20/12/1998</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>9+11/10/2006</td>
<td>7 years 10 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Latvia</td>
<td>10/02/1999</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>EU TPR</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Estonia</td>
<td>13/11/1999</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>EU TPR</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Jordan</td>
<td>11/04/2000</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>10+12/11/2008</td>
<td>8 years 7 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Georgia</td>
<td>14/06/2000</td>
<td>222</td>
<td>8+10/12/2009</td>
<td>9 years 6 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Albania</td>
<td>08/09/2000</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>28+30/04/2010</td>
<td>9 years 7 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Oman</td>
<td>09/11/2000</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>25+27/06/2008</td>
<td>7 years 7 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Croatia</td>
<td>30/11/2000</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>24+26/03/2010</td>
<td>9 years 4 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Lithuania</td>
<td>31/05/2001</td>
<td>144</td>
<td>EU TPR</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Moldova, Republic of</td>
<td>26/07/2001</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>19+21/10/2015</td>
<td>14 years 3 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>China</td>
<td>11/12/2001</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>19+21/04/2006</td>
<td>4 years 4 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Chinese Taipei</td>
<td>01/01/2002</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>20+22/06/2006</td>
<td>4 years 5 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Armenia</td>
<td>05/02/2003</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>6+8/04/2010</td>
<td>7 years 2 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>FYROM</td>
<td>04/04/2003</td>
<td>141</td>
<td>27+29/11/2013</td>
<td>10 years 7 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>23/04/2004</td>
<td>195</td>
<td>13+15/03/2012</td>
<td>7 years 11 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Cambodia</td>
<td>13/10/2004</td>
<td>368</td>
<td>1+3/11/2011</td>
<td>7 years 1 month</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Saudi Arabia, Kingdom of</td>
<td>11/12/2005</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>25+27/01/2012</td>
<td>6 years 1 month</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Viet Nam</td>
<td>11/01/2007</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>17+19/09/2013</td>
<td>6 years 8 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Tonga</td>
<td>27/07/2007</td>
<td>559</td>
<td>11+13/02/2014</td>
<td>6 years 7 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Ukraine</td>
<td>16/05/2008</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>19+21/04/2016</td>
<td>7 years 11 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Cabo Verde</td>
<td>23/07/2008</td>
<td>188</td>
<td>06+08/10/2015</td>
<td>7 years 3 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Montenegro</td>
<td>29/04/2012</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>To be scheduled</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Samoa</td>
<td>10/05/2012</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>To be scheduled</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Russian Federation</td>
<td>22/08/2012</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>28+30/09/2016</td>
<td>4 years 1 month</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Vanuatu</td>
<td>24/08/2012</td>
<td>273</td>
<td>To be scheduled</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Lao PDR</td>
<td>02/02/2013</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>To be scheduled</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Tajikistan</td>
<td>02/03/2013</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>To be scheduled</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Yemen</td>
<td>26/06/2014</td>
<td>174</td>
<td>To be scheduled</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Seychelles</td>
<td>26/04/2015</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>To be scheduled</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Kazakhstan</td>
<td>30/11/2015</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>To be scheduled</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Liberia</td>
<td>14/07/2016</td>
<td>181</td>
<td>To be scheduled</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Afghanistan</td>
<td>29/07/2016</td>
<td>195</td>
<td>To be scheduled</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>133</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>8 years 1 month</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: WTO Secretariat

4 Albania, Georgia, Kyrgyz Republic, Moldova, Republic of, Montenegro, Nepal, Oman, Samoa, Saudi Arabia, Kingdom of, Seychelles, Tajikistan, Russian Federation, Ukraine and Yemen.
11. The post-accession transition period is defined as from Day 1 of the membership to the first TPR. The review exercise typically provides the first opportunity for Members to examine the trade policies and practices across the board of an Article XII Member following its accession to the WTO. Most of the 36 Article XII Members are in the 6-year cycle, except China (2/4-year cycle), the Russian Federation (4-year cycle), Saudi Arabia, Kingdom of (4-year cycle) and Chinese Taipei (4-year cycle). On average, the first TPR for Article XII Members has taken place 8 years and 1 month after the membership date (Table I). During this period, Article XII Members are encouraged to participate actively in the work of the WTO. At the China Round Table in Dushanbe, one Article XII Member suggested that it was important to become a "pro-active" Member of the WTO during this period by gradually shifting strategies from the "listening mode" to an active membership through, for instance, the submission of negotiating proposals, making requests to other Members, participation in (or leading) coalitions and groupings, use of the Dispute Settlement System, if necessary, and/or joining plurilateral agreements. According to this participant, such pro-active membership behaviour may entail pursuing both offensive and defensive positions depending on the interests at stake, on the one hand, while safeguarding the rules-based multilateral trading system on the other.

3 BEST PRACTICES ON POST-ACCESSION

12. This Section provides an overview of post-accession best practices which have emerged from the 36 completed accessions. Post-accession practices are structured around seven areas: (i) Policy Framework for Implementation; (ii) Institutional Structural Adjustment; (iii) Legislative Framework for Implementation; (iv) Transparency; (v) Technical Assistance and Capacity Building; (vi) Outreach; and (vii) Participation in the work of the WTO.

3.1 Policy Framework for WTO Membership

13. The establishment of a policy framework for post-accession is critical not only for the implementation of commitments by Article XII Members but also for the further utilization of the WTO platform as an integral part of their domestic structural reforms in the post-accession phase. In this regard, several Article XII Members (Cambodia, Georgia, Laos PDR, Moldova, Republic of, Montenegro, Samoa, Seychelles, Tajikistan, Russian Federation, Ukraine and Yemen) developed and adopted a specific Post-Accession Implementation Strategy (Action Plan, Framework or Matrix), while others have incorporated the implementation of accession commitments into their national trade policy and development plans (China, Jordan, Chinese Taipei, Viet Nam), or deeper integration initiatives at the bilateral or regional level (Albania, Armenia, Bulgaria, Estonia, Georgia, Latvia, Lithuania, Moldova, Republic of, FYROM, Viet Nam).

14. A Post-Accession Implementation Strategy contains a list of actions for the implementation of WTO commitments, together with the designation of ministries/agencies responsible for implementation, including notifications. The title of this document varies from one Member to the other (e.g. Action Plan, Matrix, Work Plan). The Strategy is normally prepared by the coordinating Ministry responsible for WTO affairs, in consultation with line ministries/agencies responsible for implementation of specific commitments. In some cases, the Post-Accession Implementation Strategy was formally adopted by the Government (Cambodia, Montenegro and the Russian Federation), including through a Presidential or Cabinet decree (Tajikistan and Ukraine). The implementation of the Post-Accession Strategy/Action Plan is subject to regular monitoring and reviews. In the case of Tajikistan, the implementing ministries/agencies are required to report, on a quarterly basis, to the Ministry of Economic Development and Trade, which in turn reports to the Government every six months, while in the Russian Federation, the Plan is reviewed annually.

---

5 China was in the 4-year cycle for its first TPR in 2006 and was shifted to the 2-year cycle from its second TPR in 2008.

6 For Tajikistan, the Presidential Degree No. 691 "On Approval of the "Programme of Adjustment of the Economy of the Republic of Tajikistan Related to the Membership in the WTO" of 31 October 2014, and for Ukraine, the Orders of the Cabinet of Ministers No. 1381 "On Approval of the Action Plan on Adaption of the Economy of Ukraine to the WTO Requirements of 30 October 2008 and No. 1570 "On Approval of the Plan of Urgent Actions for Executing Ukraine's Obligations under the WTO Membership" of 17 December 2008.
15. In the case of LDCs, the Post-Accession Implementation Strategy also contains financial/technical assistance and capacity building needs for the implementation of WTO commitments. As described in the Introduction Section of this Note, such strategies have been developed for Afghanistan and Liberia, and include technical assistance, capacity building and other support required for implementation, including soft and hard infrastructure which is essential to maximize the benefits of integration into the global economy. In some cases, the Post-Accession Strategy is synchronised with the Diagnostic Trade Integration Study Action Matrix of the Enhanced Integrated Framework, in order to ensure adequate funding for post-accession needs of the Article XII LDCs (see more details in Annex 2).

16. In other Article XII Members, the implementation of WTO accession commitments has been incorporated into a broader national development plan, accompanied by a series of sectoral action plans/strategy. In Jordan, the post-accession reform agenda was incorporated in the Social and Economic Transformation Programme (2002-2004), followed by the Social Economic Development Plan (2004-2006) and the National Agenda (2006-2015), and in Cambodia, it was incorporated into the National Poverty Reduction Strategy (2003-2005) and the National Strategic Development Plan (2008-2013). In the case of China, following its WTO accession in 2001, the acceleration of economic structural reform remained the central issue on the work agenda of the Government and was implemented through sectoral policies in line with its long term basic national policy of 'Opening Up'. Chinese Taipei in 2002 adopted a new six-year economic development plan "Challenge 2008" to set out three programmes of reforms and ten key individual plans.

17. The implementation of accession-commitments requires coordination and synchronisation at the regional level. In the case of the Russian Federation, the Eurasian Economic Commission, the executive body of the Eurasian Economic Union (EAEU), adopted the Working Plan to adjust the legal and regulatory framework of the EAEU with the commitments taken by EAEU member States in the course of accession to the WTO. Notably, in some earlier accession cases, the WTO membership was also part of deeper integration initiatives at the regional level, such as closer integration with the European Union (Albania, Armenia, Bulgaria, Estonia, Georgia, Moldova, Republic of, Latvia, Lithuania and Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia).

Box 1: Policy Framework for WTO Membership

- Adopt Post-Accession Implementation Strategy (with technical assistance and capacity buildings needs for LDCs), which is subject to periodic reporting and reviews
- Mainstream WTO accession commitments into broader national development plans
- Synchronize WTO accession commitments to regional trade integration initiatives

18. Coordination is one of key aspects for Members' engagement in the WTO, whether during accession or post-accession. However, in the post-accession period, domestic coordination at various levels, and coordination between the capital and Geneva, would determine more critically the effectiveness of participation in the work of the WTO as a Member, that is, the level of benefits which that Member can derive from its WTO membership. While many, if not all, Acceding Governments establish coordination mechanisms at the national level during accession, such as the Inter-Ministerial Coordinating Committee on WTO Accession, it is important to refocus and broaden the scope and mandate for coordination and consultations in preparation for WTO membership. In addition, the day-to-day participation in the work of the WTO as Member requires more resources at the Geneva Missions, in comparison to the accession process during which Acceding Governments act in their observer capacity.

3.2.1 Coordination in Capital

19. Most Article XII Members retain the focal point and coordinating structure used during accession for the post-accession phase. However, the mandates of the Accession Chief Negotiator (and their Negotiating Team) and the National Coordinating Committee are adjusted to the implementation of commitments and membership responsibilities in the WTO (Cambodia, Montenegro, Nepal, Oman, Samoa, Saudi Arabia, Kingdom of, Seychelles, Tajikistan) and in some cases, by issuing decrees (Georgia, Kyrgyz Republic, Russian Federation, Ukraine). The national coordinating body, while its name varies from one Article XII Member to another, is chaired by the
minister of the coordinating ministry, and comprises representatives of various ministries involved in the implementation of WTO commitments, including notification obligations. In some cases, issue-specific working groups/sub-committees exist under the coordinating committee (Jordan, Oman, Saudi Arabia, Kingdom of, Chinese Taipei, Viet Nam). There are also cases where the focal point for WTO affairs is shifted to another ministry at the time of membership; for instance, from the Ministry of Finance to the Ministry of Economy in the Kyrgyz Republic, and Ministry of Foreign Affairs to the Ministry of Commerce and Industry in Saudi Arabia.

20. In some cases, a dedicated division on WTO affairs within the coordinating ministry is established, with the focus on the implementation of commitments. In Tajikistan, the core negotiating team for accession became part of a newly established "WTO Directorate" within the Ministry of Economic Development and Trade, under direct supervision of the First Deputy Minister. In Nepal, a dedicated "WTO Commitment Implementation Section" under the WTO Division in the Ministry of Commerce and Supplies was created, and while in Cambodia, the Department of Notifications and Legal Compliance was established in the Ministry of Commerce. In the Russian Federation, in order to strengthen and support its participation in the WTO, the Centre of Competence on WTO Matters was established in 2014 and was staffed with leading trade policy experts.

21. With WTO membership, the necessity and scope for domestic consultations is generally expanded, in particular, with respect to the business sector. In China, eight industry associations were set up to collect and share information, identify and deal with industry problems, discuss trade policy issues that affect their industries, and represent their sectors in relation to the Government. In Albania, the National Economic Council (NEC) was established as a common framework for consultation to facilitate government–business relations. The Russian Federation established the Special Committee on Integration, Trade and Customs Policy and the WTO, bringing together some 130 sectoral and regional associations under the Russian Union of Industrialists and Entrepreneurs. In some cases, private sector representatives (e.g., the Chamber of Commerce) are included in the national coordinating bodies (Kyrgyz Republic, Oman and Samoa). In Cambodia, dialogue between the government and the private sector continues to take place in the Government-Private Sector Forum, and its Eight Working Groups, as well as the Steering Committee on Private Sector Development and its Sub-Committees, which were established during its accession to the WTO.

22. In addition to coordination among government bodies and with the private sector, the domestic coordination is also required between the central and sub-central bodies. In the case of the Russian Federation, in order to ensure coordination of the federal and regional executive bodies and to strengthen the monitoring of the implementation of the accession-specific commitments, the Government Resolution No. 288 of 14 April 2014 "On the Procedure of the coordination of the Federal authorities and Sub-Federal bodies of executive power in the matter of participation of the Russian Federation in the WTO" was adopted.

---

7 The name of the coordinating body varies from one Member to another e.g. the Inter-institutional Working Group on Assessment of Trade Policy (Albania), the Inter-Ministerial Coordinating Committee on WTO Commitments (Cambodia), the Interagency Commission (Georgia), the Inter-departmental Commission (Kyrgyz Republic), the National Committee on the WTO (Oman, Yemen), the Inter-ministerial Working Group (Mongolia), the Supreme Ministerial Committee (Saudi Arabia), the National WTO Working Group (Seychelles); and in some case, the WTO Affairs are covered by a Committee overseeing all trade matters such as the Board of Trade (Nepal) and the National Working Committee on Trade Arrangements (Samoa).

8 These include: the China Coal Industry Association; China Iron and Steel Association; China National Textiles and Clothing Association; China Machine Industry Federation; China Petroleum and Chemical Industry Association; China Light Industry Federation; China Building Material Industry Association; China Nonferrous Metals Society. (WT/TPR/S/161/Rev.1)

9 The eight Working Groups include: agriculture and agro-industry; tourism; manufacturing and small and medium enterprises; law, tax and governance; banking and financial services; export processing and trade facilitation; energy, transport and infrastructure; and industrial relations. The four sub-committees under the Steering Committee on Private Sector Development include: investment climate and private participation in infrastructure; trade facilitation; small and medium enterprises; and corporate governance. (WT/TPR/G/253).
3.2.2 Coordination between Capital and Geneva

23. One major aspect of being a WTO Member is the need to attend, contribute to and report back to capital on regular meetings of the WTO. Staffing resources at the Geneva Mission is critical for covering meetings and delivering written or oral contributions at these meetings. The WTO is a meeting-intensive Organization: there are some 40 WTO bodies under the General Council, including the negotiating bodies. These bodies dealing with WTO regular work generally meet once to four times a year, not including additional consultations held in an informal mode, while the negotiating bodies meet as frequently as necessary, depending on the state of the negotiations. According to the Secretariat, 269 formal and informal meetings of the WTO bodies were held in 2015. This number, however, does not include other meetings, such as coordination meetings of various informal groupings, which take place before meetings of the WTO regular or negotiating bodies.10

24. With WTO membership, Article XII Members often upgrade their Geneva missions to cope with the day-to-day work of the WTO, for increased coordination and communications between Capital and Geneva. Several Members, such as Armenia, Bulgaria, China, Ecuador, Montenegro, Saudi Arabia, Kingdom of, and the Russian Federation, established Missions dedicated to WTO affairs with the appointment of a Permanent Representative to the WTO, separate from ones to the United Nations. In the case of the Kyrgyz Republic, the Ministry of Economy established a Representative to the WTO within its Geneva Mission, although not at the level of permanent representative, while a dedicated WTO Section with two staff was established within the Permanent Mission of Tajikistan in Geneva after its accession to the WTO. In the case of Ukraine, in order to ensure the effective capital-Geneva coordination, the post of a Trade Representative to the WTO, at the level of Deputy Minister based in the capital was established.12

25. Some Article XII Members, however, still remain without physical representation in Geneva. Samoa, Tonga and Vanuatu are represented by their respective Embassies based in Brussels and London. According to them, their non-resident status makes it difficult to realize the full benefits of WTO membership, except the joint representation by the Pacific Islands Forum Secretariat in Geneva and the participation in biannual "Geneva Weeks" (week-long briefing sessions for non-resident WTO Members and observers). It is important to note, however, that several Article XII Members, such as Cambodia, Lao PDR and Seychelles established their Geneva representation towards the end of their accession process, with the anticipation of intensive work associated with the final stages of accession negotiations and eventual membership.

Box 2: Institutional and Coordination Structures

- Appoint/re-appoint the lead ministry dealing with WTO affairs, with mandate on the implementation of commitments and the coordination of day-to-day work of the WTO
- Establish/restructure an inter-ministry coordination body, with the participation of line ministries/agencies/focal points tasked with implementation and notifications
- Establish a consultative mechanism(s) with the business sector
- Establish regular coordination and communications between capital and Geneva
- Enhance the Permanent Mission to the UNOG, including through the appointment of a dedicated representative to the WTO and increased staff to handle WTO affairs
- Establish a separate Permanent Mission to the WTO

3.3 Legislative Framework for Implementation

26. While accession to the WTO is a lengthy legislation-based negotiating process, the alignment of national legislation and regulation with the WTO rules is a critical aspect of WTO membership. Building on the legislative framework established during the accession process, Article XII Members ensure that any future legislative developments and adjustments are made in compliance with the WTO rules and principles in the post-accession period. According to the

---

10 This number excludes Accession Working Parties and committees on Plurilateral Agreements where the membership is limited to those parties to the negotiations or the agreements.
11 27 of such groups are officially listed and recognised in the negotiations in the WTO. See the list of Groups in the negotiations at https://www.wto.org/english/tratop_e/dda_e/negotiating_groups_e.htm.
12 As per the Regulation of the Cabinet of Ministers No. 550 of 16 October 2014.
information provided by Article XII Members, for instance, the Russian Federation, since its accession to the WTO in August 2012, adopted or amended about 200 legal acts, to implement its accession-specific commitments, while Georgia amended 50 legal acts in respect with its accession-specific commitments since its WTO membership in 2000. Some Article XII Members have established WTO-specific bodies in order to enhance coherence of the domestic reform process and monitor compliance of national legislation with WTO requirements. For instance, Ukraine established a Unit within the Ministry of Economic Development and Trade which ensured compliance of the domestic legislation through a consultative and coordination domestic mechanism.

27. The Accession Protocol sets out the foundation for Article XII Members to implement WTO-compliant legislation in the post-accession period. For LDCs, such as Nepal, Samoa and Yemen, the Action Plans contained in the Accession Protocol set out the list of legislation which need to be brought in line with the WTO Agreements. For instance, Nepal, since its accession in 2004, has completed 24 out of 42 legal commitments outlined in the Legislative Action Plan, while the remaining number of commitments is in the process of completion. Another important element outlined in the Accession Protocol is the judicial review process for administrative action. In China, the Supreme Court abolished around 20 legal interpretations that were not consistent with the WTO Agreement and further clarified the Court’s jurisdiction over international trade-related administrative litigations.13

Box 3: Legislative Framework for Implementation

- Continue to use the legislative framework established during accession in the post-accession period, including through the creation of a legislative mechanism / body / process to monitor compliance of national legislation with WTO requirements

3.4 Transparency

28. Transparency is a key principle of the Multilateral Trading System which underpins all WTO Agreements. The two fundamental requirements for transparency are: (i) publication of relevant information on trade; and (ii) timely notification of new trade-related measures and legislation. Accession-specific commitments on transparency undertaken by Article XII Members have strengthened the transparency rules of the System, in particular, with regard to the publication of legislation.14

29. Regarding the publication of trade-related information, all Article XII Members publish trade-related laws and regulations in Official Gazettes/Journals, newspapers and/or official websites, except in cases where a transitional period is granted (e.g. Samoa until 2017). Several accession-commitments on transparency involve the period that Article XII Members would need to grant for consultation and comments, prior to enforcing the measure. For instance, China in 2003 adopted the Legislation Law and the Regulations on Procedures for the Formulation of Administrative Regulations and the Regulations on Procedures for the Formulation of Rules, which have institutionalised transparency in the legislation formulation process. These laws and regulations require that public opinions be sought in the formulation of legislation and provided procedures for the publication of legislation.15

30. On notifications, overall, Article XII Members have better adherence to the transparency obligations than original WTO Members. Chart 1 shows that Article XII Members have consistently had higher compliance rates on notifications than original WTO Members. More specifically, since accession to the WTO, all Article XII Members have established and notified an Enquiry Point, jointly or separately for SPS and/or TBT. The domestic coordination of notifications is critical in ensuring timely submission. In some cases, the centralised body for all other notifications is established, such as the WTO Notification and Enquiry Centre in China, the WTO Information and Notification Centre in Moldova, Republic of, and the WTO Enquiry Point and Notification Authority in Ukraine. In other cases, the ministry responsible for WTO affairs serves as the focal point for

---

15 WT/TPR/G/161.
the submission of all notifications to the WTO, in coordination with line ministries/agencies implementing specific notification requirements.

Chart 1: Average notifications made annually, period 2008-2015

Source: WTO Secretariat

Box 4: Transparency

- Set up a web-based portal for all trade-related information
- Set up and notify the Enquiry Points on SPS, TBT and TRIPS, as required by the WTO Agreements
- Establish a focal point and a central registry for all notifications submitted to the WTO

3.5 Technical Assistance and Capacity Building

31. Technical assistance and capacity building (TA/CB) is an integral part of the accession process, as they build knowledge and expertise on the WTO Agreements. This is particularly important for acceding LDC governments. In other words, the accession process is one of the best capacity building exercises available in the WTO, evidence of which is reflected in the overall effective participation of Article XII Members in the work of the WTO in the post-accession period (see Section 3.7). At the same time, the needs for training and capacity building tend to increase in the post-accession period as the Government seeks greater involvement of line ministries and more stakeholders, including from non-governmental sectors, for the implementation of accession commitments and the participation in the work of the WTO. Hence, it is critical that the provision of training and capacity building is continuous and integrated into a country’s trade policy making and implementation processes.

32. Based on the responses to the post-accession questionnaire, one of the immediate needs for post-accession TA/CB is to technically equip not only the WTO focal points, but also a broader range of government officials, particularly from line ministries and government agencies. Reflecting these needs, the three most frequently requested, face-to-face, post-accession technical assistance activities from the WTO Secretariat are: (i) general capacity building on the WTO Agreements; (ii) notifications; and (iii) specific WTO areas which contain accession commitments with transition periods, such as TBT, SPS and TRIPS, as well as the Government Procurement Agreement where several Article XII Members made a commitment to initiate negotiations within a period specified in the Accession Protocol. In this regard, it is important for the WTO focal point to familiarise itself with the TA/CB needs of line ministries, including through periodic consultations (as Oman and Samoa have done), so that it is in the position to allocate limited training slots
offered by external TA/CB providers to the best qualified officials. Some Article XII Members, such as Samoa, have made extensive use of E-Learning, in order to cope with suddenly increased demands from line ministries for knowledge building on specific WTO agreements in the immediate post-accession period.

33. Article XII Members heavily rely on the provision of TA/CB from the WTO Secretariat, through its biennial Technical Assistance and Training Plans\textsuperscript{16} which have recently identified post-accession as an area of focus. These are complemented by TA/CB support from other multilateral institutions (such as UNCTAD, ITC, World Bank) as well as bilateral partners (US, EU and its member states, such as Sweden). Several Article XII Members (Cambodia, China, Russian Federation, Ukraine, Viet Nam) have established in-house training programmes, in order to respond to increased demands within the government and the need for greater outreach to non-governmental stakeholders. For instance, the Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation developed training programmes dedicated on trade policy and WTO rules, with leading universities such as the Higher School of Economics at the State University and the St. Petersburg State University. In the case of Saudi Arabia, the World Trade Services Centre (WTSC) was established in April 2014. The Centre operates a specialised Reference Centre for the WTO, promotes the E-learning courses among government officials and the private sector, and conducts national workshops on issues related to international trade and the WTO. Some Article XII Members, such as Cambodia, China, Oman and Tajikistan, have actively hosted WTO regional activities, including the Regional Trade Policy Courses and the China Round Tables, to make substantive contributions to discussion or share their direct experiences on specific WTO topics.

Box 5: Technical Assistance and Capacity Building

- Make use of training opportunities provided by the WTO and others by sending qualified officials, including from line ministries, selected on a competitive basis
- Develop and deliver in-house training programmes on WTO matters
- Hold period consultations with line ministries to identify TA/CB needs

3.6 Outreach

34. Participation in the WTO can be facilitated and its benefits could be maximised if conducted with the support and understanding of relevant stakeholders. Outreach to non-governmental stakeholders becomes critical towards the end of the accession negotiations, as the acceding government needs to secure buy-ins from parliamentarians, businesses, media and the civil society, which play a critical role in the ratification process of the Protocol of Accession. For instance, in the Russian Federation, which concluded its accession negotiations in December 2011 and became the 159\textsuperscript{th} Member of the WTO in August 2012, the government organized 160 conferences, seminars and round tables on WTO issues with the participation of all relevant stakeholders in 62 regions between 2011 and 2013. The WTO Secretariat provides tailor-made post-accession support, often together with the Chairman of the Working Party, to complement the acceding governments' outreach efforts, either immediately before or after the adoption of the accession package. For instance, in Afghanistan, Lao PDR, Liberia, Samoa, Seychelles, Tajikistan and Vanuatu, the Accessions Division made presentations on WTO membership, including on the terms and conditions, as well as the benefits, to the parliament, the business community, academic institutions, media and/or the local donor community in 2011-2015.

35. In the post-accession period, almost all Article XII Members set up awareness programmes aimed at increasing WTO knowledge through various channels. These included: (i) holding of symposiums, conferences and seminars involving the private sector, civil society and academia (Cambodia, China, Chinese Taipei, Ukraine, Viet Nam, Seychelles, Yemen, Moldova, Republic of, Montenegro, Samoa, Nepal, Oman, Russian Federation and Saudi Arabia, Kingdom of);\textsuperscript{17} (ii) The latest Biennial Technical Assistance and Training Plan 2016-17 is contained in document WT/COMTD/W/211.\textsuperscript{17} For instance, the Russian Federation annually holds a large-scale conference on "Russia in the WTO", which is aimed at raising awareness on the benefits of WTO membership and the significance of the implementation results for all relevant stakeholders. In the Kyrgyz Republic, the Government, in partnership with local universities and the donor community, have organised round tables, workshops and conferences on WTO issues and to publish academic related studies, including the "Consequences of Accession of the Kyrgyz
establishment of specialized courses on WTO subjects in higher educational institutions (Cambodia, China, Samoa, Oman, Kyrgyz Republic, Russian Federation); (iii) establishment of a research centre on WTO (China, Russian Federation, Saudi Arabia, Kingdom of), or enhancement of the WTO Reference Centre (Samoa, Seychelles, Nepal); and (iv) publication of special materials and books on WTO issues (Cambodia, China, Nepal, Kyrgyz Republic, Seychelles, Russian Federation), including the translation of WTO Agreements into native languages (China, Kyrgyz Republic and Tajikistan).

36. Among all stakeholders with an interest in the WTO, several Article XII Members have made particular efforts to engage the private sector, including on dispute settlement. For instance, Vietnam, since its accession to the WTO in 2007, has organized 1,004 workshops on WTO-related matters for nearly 10,000 enterprises, and provided legal consultancy for 7,600 WTO-related cases. In the case of Saudi Arabia, which identified the spreading of WTO knowledge to the private sector as a major challenge, the World Trade Services Centre was established with the aim of building a strategic relationship with the Saudi business society in order to increase its awareness about the WTO agreements. In the Russian Federation, the Committee on Integration, Trade and Customs Policy and the WTO hold regular meetings with the Russian Union of Industrialists and Entrepreneurs, which brings together 130 sectoral and regional associations of employers, providing a venue for debates on WTO issues between business stakeholders and government officials. In other cases, the government provides training opportunity directly to the private sector on the WTO. The Government of Oman, for instance, in 2014, launched a program whereby private sector officials are trained at its Permanent Mission in Geneva.

Box 6: Outreach

- Initiate outreach activities to non-governmental stakeholders during the end phase of the accession process, through symposiums, conferences and seminars
- Set up specialized courses on WTO subjects in higher educational institutions
- Set up information centre on the WTO, including the WTO Reference Centre

3.7 Participation in the work of the WTO

37. Once the policy, institutional and legislative frameworks for WTO membership with the allocation of resources and responsibilities, are established, Article XII Members must engage in the day-to-day work of the Organization. Such day-to-day participation encompasses three key functions of the WTO: (i) administration of the WTO Agreements through regular work i.e. three Councils under the General Council covering Trade in Goods, Trade in Services and TRIPS, with each having committees and working groups directly reporting to the Council (i.e., 12 and four committee/working groups related to goods and services, respectively), in addition to the six Committees, 19 Accession Working Parties, two Working Groups and three Committees overseeing the Plurilateral Agreements, reporting directly to the General Council, plus the Trade Policy Review Body and the Dispute Settlement Body, in parallel to the General Council; (ii) negotiations; and (iii) dispute settlement. Post-accession experience from Article XII Members has consistently demonstrated that regular attendance and participation at WTO meetings is the most reliable and effective form of building post-accession capacity and deepening WTO knowledge. At the end, it is only through the participation on the basis of “learning by doing” that a Member can realize and maximise the benefits of WTO membership.

38. The administration and monitoring of the implementation of WTO Agreements is a major part of the regular work of the WTO. This also constitutes the majority of post-accession work. The participation in regular work starts with the submission of initial notifications, which kick in on the date of membership. As already described in Section 3.4 Transparency, Article XII Members have consistently had higher compliance rates on notifications than original WTO Members. Apart from the implementation of own commitments, including the submission of notifications, the participation in regular commitments requires constant monitoring and review of trade policy developments and practices of other Members which may be brought up in these committees.
39. Many Article XII Members are active participants in WTO negotiations, individually and as a group. In the DDA negotiations, 22 Article XII Members\(^{18}\) formed a group of "Recently Acceded Members" (RAMs), which submitted various proposals to negotiating groups in Agriculture and NAMA.\(^{19}\) In addition, Article XII Members are active participants in the Accession Working Parties, as illustrated in Chart 2, ensuring that WTO accessions contribute to safeguarding the multilateral trading system by updating the rules and expanding market access opportunities.\(^{20}\)

It is also important to note that the expansion of the plurilateral Agreement on Government Procurement (GPA) is largely due to the participation of Article XII Members, which account for 29% to the membership and 89% of the accession negotiations in progress (Table 2), since more than 70% of them agreed to initiate the GPA negotiations as part of its WTO accession commitments. Participation in the GPA is a good example of the continuous use of the multilateral trading system as an instrument for domestic reforms after accession.

**Chart 2: Article XII Membership in Accession Working Parties, as of May 2016**

![Bar chart](chart.png)

Source: WTO Secretariat

---

18 Albania, Armenia, Cabo Verde, China, Ecuador, Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, Georgia, Jordan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyz Republic, Moldova, Republic of, Mongolia, Oman, Panama, Russian Federation, Saudi Arabia, Kingdom of, Seychelles, Chinese Taipei, Tajikistan, Tonga, Ukraine and Viet Nam.

19 See for instance, the submissions by the RAMs Group in document JOB(03)/170 (22 August 2003), JOB/AG/12 (6 July 2010) and TN/AG/GEN/24 (13 March 2007); by Small Low-Income Economies in Transition, Recently Acceded to the WTO - Armenia, the Kyrgyz Republic and Moldova, Republic of in document TN/AG/GEN/16 (20 April 2006) in Agriculture; and in document TN/MA/W/83 (26 February 2007) and JOB(08)/22 (27 March 2008) in NAMA.

Table 2: Participation of Article XII Members in GPA Negotiations as of June 2016

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Article XII Member</th>
<th>Date of Membership</th>
<th>GPA Parties</th>
<th>GPA Observers</th>
<th>GPA Accession Negotiations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bulgaria</td>
<td>01/12/1996</td>
<td>1 January 2007</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mongolia</td>
<td>29/01/1997</td>
<td></td>
<td>23 February 1999</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Panama</td>
<td>06/09/1997</td>
<td></td>
<td>29 September 1997</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kyrgyz Republic</td>
<td>20/12/1998</td>
<td></td>
<td>5 October 1999</td>
<td>In progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latvia</td>
<td>10/02/1999</td>
<td>1 May 2004</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estonia</td>
<td>13/11/1999</td>
<td>1 May 2004</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jordan</td>
<td>11/04/2000</td>
<td></td>
<td>8 March 2000</td>
<td>In progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Georgia</td>
<td>14/06/2000</td>
<td></td>
<td>5 October 1999</td>
<td>In progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Albania</td>
<td>08/09/2000</td>
<td></td>
<td>2 October 2001</td>
<td>In progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oman</td>
<td>09/11/2000</td>
<td></td>
<td>3 May 2001</td>
<td>In progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Croatia</td>
<td>30/11/2000</td>
<td>1 July 2013</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lithuania</td>
<td>31/05/2001</td>
<td></td>
<td>29 September 2000</td>
<td>In progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moldova, Republic of</td>
<td>26/07/2001</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>11/12/2001</td>
<td></td>
<td>21 February 2002</td>
<td>In progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chinese Taipei</td>
<td>01/01/2002</td>
<td></td>
<td>15 July 2009</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Armenia</td>
<td>05/02/2003</td>
<td></td>
<td>15 September 2011</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FYROM</td>
<td>04/04/2003</td>
<td></td>
<td>27 June 2013</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Viet Nam</td>
<td>11/01/2007</td>
<td></td>
<td>5 December 2012</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ukraine</td>
<td>16/05/2008</td>
<td></td>
<td>18 May 2016</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montenegro</td>
<td>29/04/2012</td>
<td></td>
<td>15 July 2015</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Russian Federation</td>
<td>22/08/2012</td>
<td></td>
<td>29 May 2013</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tajikistan</td>
<td>02/03/2013</td>
<td></td>
<td>25 June 2014</td>
<td>In progress</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: WTO Secretariat

40. Article XII Members are active users of the WTO Dispute Settlement Mechanism (DSM). In total, Article XII Members have been involved in one fifth of the WTO dispute cases, either as complainants or respondents. Also, Article XII Members have acted as third parties in dispute settlement cases more than 300 times, with some being more active such as China in 130 cases, Chinese Taipei in 90 cases and Saudi Arabia in 28 cases. They use this process to familiarize themselves with the DS process and effectively exercise their WTO rights (Table 3).

Table 3: Participation of Article XII Members in Dispute Settlement as of June 2016

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Article XII Member</th>
<th>Date of Membership</th>
<th>Date of First Request for Consultations/Reservation As Complaint</th>
<th>As Respondent</th>
<th>As Third Party</th>
<th>Number of Case As Complaint</th>
<th>As Respondent</th>
<th>As Third Party</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ecuador</td>
<td>21/01/1996</td>
<td>02/1996</td>
<td>11/2003</td>
<td>02/2003</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Panama</td>
<td>06/09/1997</td>
<td>10/1997</td>
<td>03/2005</td>
<td>01/2003</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oman</td>
<td>09/11/2000</td>
<td></td>
<td>07/2012</td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Croatia</td>
<td>30/11/2000</td>
<td>03/2001</td>
<td>02/2011</td>
<td>09/2012</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chinese Taipei</td>
<td>01/01/2002</td>
<td>11/2002</td>
<td>07/2002</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Armenia</td>
<td>05/02/2003</td>
<td>07/2010</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saudi Arabia, Kingdom of</td>
<td>11/12/2005</td>
<td></td>
<td>01/2009</td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Viet Nam</td>
<td>11/01/2007</td>
<td>02/2010</td>
<td>02/2007</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ukraine</td>
<td>16/05/2008</td>
<td>07/2010</td>
<td>03/2011</td>
<td>09/2013</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Russian Federation</td>
<td>22/08/2012</td>
<td>12/2013</td>
<td>07/2013</td>
<td>11/2012</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kazakhstan</td>
<td>30/11/2015</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>05/2015</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: WTO Secretariat
Box 7: Participation in the work of the WTO

- Attend and participate in meetings of WTO regular and negotiating bodies, as learning by doing is the best form of knowledge and capacity building
- Submit notifications from Day 1 of membership
- Participate constructively in Accession Working Parties and GPA negotiations to safeguard the multilateral trading system by updating the rules and expanding market access

4 CONCLUSION

41. The importance of post-accession implementation and support has gained recognition among WTO Members and acceding governments in recent years, in particular, with an increased number of concluded LDCs’ accessions.\(^{21}\) From the post-accession dialogue held during the Third China Round Table in Dushanbe and the replies received from Article XII Members on the WTO Secretariat Post-Accession Questionnaire, it is evident that the challenges and opportunities associated with the post-accession period are as great as, if not greater than, those of the accession process. The benefits of WTO membership can only be realized through the full implementation of WTO obligations by Article XII Members, including their accession-specific commitments, and their active participation in the work of the WTO, so that the multilateral trading system continues to provide them with an effective instrument for domestic reforms and economic transformation, as it did during the accession process.

42. Based on the experience and lessons learned from 36 accessions since 1995, this Note provides an overview of the emerging best practices on post-accession, which could guide new Article XII Members in the preparation for their WTO membership. These best practices on post-accession, at the same time, complement other support which is provided by the WTO Secretariat in response to specific requests for post-accession implementation, especially for newly acceded LDCs. Most importantly, it should be noted that although the realisation of the benefits of WTO membership is determined by the level of preparedness and participation by Article XII Members, other WTO Members and the international community have also a critical role to play in supporting newly joined Article XII Members, especially LDCs, during this challenging post-accession period.

\(^{21}\) Since 2012, six accessions of LDCs were concluded successfully and they became WTO Members, including Vanuatu (2012), Samoa (2012), Lao PDR (2013), Yemen (2014), Liberia (2016) and Afghanistan (2016).
ANNEX 1
POST-ACCESSION "BEST PRACTICES" QUESTIONNAIRE

1 POLICY FRAMEWORK FOR IMPLEMENTATION

1. Did the government adopt a "National WTO Implementation Strategy", or how did it mobilize and channel resources to the targeted areas of trade policy within the framework of the overall trade and development agenda?

2. How did the government monitor and review the implementation of accession-specific commitments and the post accession roadmap/action plan?

2 INSTITUTIONAL STRUCTURAL ADJUSTMENT

3. How did the government re-focus the mandate of the Accession Negotiating Team in capital to implement obligations and Membership responsibilities?

4. How did the government re-assign and strengthen the WTO team to ensure active participation in WTO activities? How did the government ensure Capital/Geneva coordination?

5. Did the government establish a domestic coordination and consultative mechanism for local, central government authorities and all relevant stakeholders? Did the government appoint WTO contact points in all the Ministries and government authorities? Please elaborate.

3 LEGISLATIVE FRAMEWORK FOR IMPLEMENTATION

6. Please describe the legislative framework for implementing accession-specific commitments. What number of legislation and associated implementing regulations were adopted or amended for the implementation of accession-specific commitments?

4 TRANSPARENCY AND COMMUNICATION

7. How did the government communicate the implementation-related information to all relevant stakeholders on a regular basis through, inter alia, publications and hearings?

8. Did the government set up Enquiry Points, such as those for SPS and TBT measures? If so, please identify.

9. Did the government develop a central registry notification system? If so, please elaborate.

5 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE AND CAPACITY BUILDING

10. How did the government identify and respond to the training and capacity building needs of the line Ministries and the local governments/authorities?

11. Did the government establish training programmes on WTO matters for government officials? If so, please elaborate.

12. Did the government request technical assistance and capacity building from the WTO Secretariat, other organisations and/or other WTO Members?

13. How did the government make use of WTO capacity building programmes, such as E-learning courses, WTO Mission Internship Programme, Netherlands Traineeship Programme, WTO Accessions Internship Programme, WTO Trade Policy Courses, the China and LDC Roundtables? Please elaborate.

14. How did the government educate its officials and private sector on the use of the Dispute Settlement? For example, did it educate them autonomously, in partnership with the WTO Secretariat, or with "other" partners?
6 OUTREACH

15. How did the government increase and sustain public awareness of the benefits of WTO Membership and the implementation results for all relevant stakeholders on a regular basis through, *inter alia*, publications, conferences, workshops, academic courses, and WTO research centres?

7 PARTICIPATION IN THE WORK OF THE WTO

16. Please provide a summary description of the participation of your government in the work of regular WTO bodies (Committees, Councils, and Working Groups), in the Doha Negotiations, and in the Dispute Settlement Body (including third party participation option).

17. What are challenges which the government has faced in its participation in the work of the WTO?

18. [Only for those Members that have undergone at least one Trade Policy Review since their membership] How did the government prepare for the first Trade Policy Review? Please describe challenges that the government encountered during the review process. Did the government request technical assistance and capacity building from the WTO Secretariat in the context of the first Trade Policy Review, particularly for those areas where implementation was lagging?

8 OTHERS

19. Please describe specific difficulties and challenges which the government has encountered as a Member.

20. How were these challenges resolved?

21. Please provide suggestions and/or advice, if any, for how the Secretariat can improve its support to Article XII Members in the post accession phase i.e. between membership and the first Trade Policy Review.
## ANNEX 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Article XII Member</th>
<th>Date of Membership</th>
<th>DTIS / DTISU</th>
<th>Contains Post-Accession Needs/Actions</th>
<th>Topics/provisions addressed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Nepal              | 23/04/2004         | 2015 (validation expected Nov 2015) | YES | • SPS system to make it compliant with WTO obligations and to help its producers benefit from trade opportunities.  
• Revision of the Foreign Investment and Technology Transfer Act (1992) slotted since Accession but remains outstanding; priority according to 2014/15 Budget Speech.  
• Complete legal reform obligations undertaken as part of the Accession; acceleration of the reform pace a priority according to the 2014/15 Budget Speech. |
| Cambodia           | 13/10/2004         | 2014         | YES | • Legislative reform and prioritization of compliance measures, including regional dimension  
• Trade Facilitation, including specific customs reform and fee structure  
• SPS  
• TBT  
• TRIPS |
| Cabo Verde         | 23/07/2008         | 2013         | YES | • Study models regime for imports and export of ITC  
• Joining the International Technology Agreement of the WTO  
• Support foreign trade including strategies compliant with WTO, EPA, AGOA, and ECOWAS |
| Samoa              | 10/05/2012         | 2010         | YES | • Fisheries, impact studies  
• LDC graduation  
• Services in regional agreements (PICTA/PACER PLUS)  
• Strengthening of National TF Committee  
• Review of SPS |
| Vanuatu            | 24/08/2012         | TPF 2012 (to be updated in near future) | YES | • Enhancing productive capacity of tourism sector  
• Strategies and studies for trade negotiations, including WTO negotiating priorities  
• International alliances beyond the Pacific region  
• WTO post-accession strategy focusing on services sector  
• Competition policy |
| Lao PDR            | 02/02/2013         | 2012         | YES | • Services  
• TBT, SPS  
• Trade and Private sector development Policy  
• Trade mainstreaming.  
• Trade Facilitation and business environment  
• Awareness raising  
• Institutional capacity building and strengthening  
• Inter-ministerial coordination  
• Domestic reform programmes  
• Regulatory framework  
• Competitiveness and diversification |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Article XII Member</th>
<th>Date of Membership</th>
<th>DTIS / DTISU</th>
<th>Contains Post-Accession Needs/Actions</th>
<th>Topics/provisions addressed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Yemen             | 26/06/2014         | 2015 (not yet validated because of the political context) | YES | • The chapters on trade policy, Agriculture, Fisheries and Services contain a multitude of references to post accession needs.  
• The action matrix includes as a key priority “establish mechanisms for monitoring implementation of WTO Accession commitments across relevant organizations.” |
| Afghanistan       | 2016 - expected    | 2012        | YES | • Animal health and foodstuffs - standards and quality  
• Legal framework, compliance with WTO agreements and requirements (including fiscal policy)  
• TBT |
| Liberia           | 2016 - expected    | 2015        | YES | • ECOWAS integration  
• Trade Facilitation  
• Infrastructure  
• Private Sector engagement and Global Value Chains  
• Strengthening SMEs  
• Agriculture  
• Institutional strengthening |

Source: EIF Executive Secretariat